Biological Control of Emerald Ash Borer: Bark sifting for *Oobius agrili*

Anna Hansen, Jonathan Osthus, and Monika Chandler Minnesota Department of Agriculture





Special Acknowledgements

 MDA would like to thank Leah Bauer and Deborah Miller with the U.S. Forest Service Northern Research Station in Lansing, MI for invaluable training and expertise that have led to increased parasitoid recovery in the field.



Emerald Ash Borer (EAB)

- Agrilus planipennis Fairmaire (Coleoptera: Buprestidae)
- Invasive phloem feeding beetle that attacks ash trees
 - Larval stage (yellow arrows) most damaging
- Discovered in U.S.A. in 2002
 - As of February 2015, EAB infestations found in 25 states (Bauer et al., 2015)



EAB Infested Ash Trees

- Larval galleries cut off water and nutrients
 - Ash tree slowly starves
- MN has highest volume of ash trees in U.S. with ~ 1 billion trees (Minn Dept. of Ag)
 - Devastating economic and environmental impacts

Minnesota Department

of Agriculture





Infested ashtree

J. Osthus, Minn Dept. of Ag

Biological Control of EAB

A- Emerald Ash Borer; B- *Oobius agrili*; C- *Tetrastichus planipennisi*



A. Hansen, Minn Dept of Ag



Biological Control Agents of EAB

A- Emerald Ash Borer; B- Oobius agrili; C- Tetrastichus planipennisi





Oobius agrili (Hymenoptera: Encyrtidae)

- Solitary egg parasitoid found in China
 - Very small, stingless wasp
- Adult wasp lays eggs inside EAB egg
 - Developing wasp kills EAB larva before it hatches
- Released as an EAB biocontrol agent in U.S. since 2007 and Canada since 2015 (USDA APHIS, 2007)



J Duan, USDA ARS BIIR Oobius agrili parasitizing EAB egg



Bark Sifting Protocol

- Evaluate field performance of *Oobius agrili*
 - Determine establishment and prevalence of released parasitoids (Duan et al., 2012)
 - Labor intensive due to small size of EAB egg and parasitoid (Duan et al., 2012)
- Bark sifting method developed in 2012 as more effective alternative to visual egg searches (Abell et al., 2014)



Collecting the Bark

- Collect bark in field, sift in lab
- Select live ash trees showing signs and symptoms of EAB attack
- Measure 10 x 50cm area on trunk. Shear off with draw knife
 - Sample from S, SW or W side of tree
- Plastic sheet set to collect sheared bark
 - Transfer bark to labeled paper bag
- Once sample has been collected and transferred to paper bag, let dry and store in cardboard box to avoid mold growing in the sample





Preparing the Sample: Defense Against Static



- Static makes transferring fine debris and eggs difficult
 - Static can send eggs flying!
- Use anti-static dryer sheet to wipe surfaces of sieve and containers





Bark Sifting: Preparing the Sieve



USDA Standard Testing Sieve No. 14

Minnesota Department

of Aariculture

- Place sheared bark into top half of sieve
 - Longer pieces of bark may need to be broken down
 - 2-3" pieces
- Avoid over-packing
 - Bark needs room to move during shaking
- Bark may need to be divided into subsamples
 - Label accordingly

Preparing the Sample: Sieving



- Shake for 2 minutes
 - 15 seconds up and down
 - 15 seconds side to side
 - Repeat 3x



Transferring the Sifted Bark Sample

- Transfer fine, sifted bark debris into a white ceramic dish for sorting, and the remaining bark into a paper bag for storage
- (Optional) Record weight of debris and leftover bark
 - On spreadsheet







Bark Sifting: Preparing for Sorting



Minnesota Department

of Aariculture

- Useful tools:
 - Dissecting microscope
 - Ceramic dish
 - Ceramic is non-static
 - Permanent marker
 - Small petri dishes
 - Forceps (for larger insects)
 - Paintbrushes
 - 1" brush
 - moving large amounts of bark
 - Size 00 round brush
 - moving small amounts of bark
 - Size 0000 round brush
 - transferring eggs

Sorting Fine Bark Debris

Sorting is done using a dissecting microscope due to small size of debris and EAB eggs





Debris Sorting: Arranging the Bark



Minimize concealing and missing eggs!

Minnesota Department

of Agriculture

- Arrange debris in thin line along the dish
 - Be able to see entire width with one pass under scope
 - Dish should only have to move from left to right
- Ensure that debris is 1 layer thick
 - See individual particles with minimal manipulation

First Glance Under Scope

- The Bark:
 - Sample will primarily contain fine bark and lichen
 - Assortment of shapes and colors







- Size 00 paintbrush useful in moving small amounts of bark
- Size 0000 paintbrush useful in removing eggs/insects

Debris Sorting: What You'll See



EAB egg among debris

- EAB eggs are ~1mm in length
- Distinct shape and amber color (usually)



Debris Sorting: What to Collect



EAB egg among debris

 Collect all insects, eggs, and any fragments that appear to be eggs

- Transfer to labelled petri dish for further examination
 - If in doubt, collect it



Debris Sorting: Collecting

- Use fine paintbrush to transfer eggs
 - Size 0000
 - Using a paintbrush will help avoid damage to eggs
 - Moistened paintbrush may help facilitate removal



Concealed EAB eggs



Partially concealed EAB eggs can be difficult to spot. Sort carefully.



Concealed EAB eggs cont.



Minnesota Department ⁄ of Agriculture Partially concealed EAB eggs can be difficult to spot. Sort carefully.



Debris Sorting

• When you've sorted the current line:



- Use 1" paintbrush to sweep debris to the bottom of the ceramic dish
 - Time efficient
 - Eliminates need for additional container
- Add new line of debris and repeat until all debris is sorted



What You'll See: EAB Eggs

- Adult EAB females lay eggs in bark crevices and between bark layers
- Eggs often adhere to flakes of bark
 - Collect egg on bark flake (to avoid damage, try to see signs/symptoms of parasitism w/o removal)

Minnesota Department

of Agriculture





Non-parasitized EAB EggsHatchedvs.Unhatched



D. Miller, USDA Forest Service

Hatched eggs have larval exit hole on bottom where packed frass (larval waste) is visible

> Minnesota Department ✓ of Agriculture



D. Miller, USDA Forest Service

No exit hole, no frass = unhatched egg

Hatched vs. Unhatched



Exit hole with packed frass circled in yellow



EAB Egg Fragments

• Not all eggs are recovered intact...









Examining EAB Egg Fragments

• Hatched or not?

Sometimes packed frass is visible. Fragments can be tricky









Visible packed frass

Parasitized EAB Eggs

- Before parasitism, EAB eggs have amber coloration
- Most EAB eggs turn dark after parasitism



Healthy EAB egg, hatched







Lab parasitized egg above

Parasitized EAB Eggs cont.

- Most EAB eggs turn dark after parasitism
- Parasitoid exit hole circled in yellow



Healthy EAB egg, hatched





Lab parasitized egg above

Other Parasitized EAB Eggs

• Not all EAB eggs turn black after parasitism...



Look for dark areas inside eggs and/or adult parasitoid exit hole

Lab parasitized egg above

Minnesota Department of Agriculture

Parasitized Egg That Did Not Change Color



Parasitoid meconium (larval waste) circled in yellow

Round adult parasitoid exit hole circled in green

Lab parasitized egg above



Which are Parasitized?

J. Hansen, Michigan State University 2011

Parasitized vs. Healthy EAB eggs

- Oobius circled in yellow
- Oobius meconium marked with arrows
- EAB larvae circled in green

J. Hansen, Michigan State University 2011

A Closer Look at Parasitized EAB Egg



- Egg recovered from Great River Bluffs State Park, MN in February, 2015
- Most parasitized eggs recovered in the field are often reddish brown rather than solid black, as usually seen in the lab

• Dark areas = suspect for parasitism



D. Miller, USDA Forest Service

A Closer Look cont.

A. Hansen, Minn Dept. of Ag





• Parasitoid air tube (circled in blue)

• Broken chorion with visible meconium (arrow)

No exit hole...Oobius still inside



D. Miller, USDA Forest Service

D. Miller, USDA Forest Service

Dissecting Parasitized EAB Eggs

Dissecting eggs confirms *Oobius* presence and life stage





- Parasitized egg recovered from Ft. Snelling State Park, MN.
- Dissection revealed adult Oobius inside



Dissecting Parasitized EAB Eggs Revealed

Dissecting eggs confirms *Oobius* presence and life stage



Minnesota Department

of Agriculture



- Recovered egg not completely black, but suspect for parasitism due to dark shadow (yellow circle)
- Dark shadow in center was adult Oobius (yellow arrow)

Dissecting Parasitized EAB Eggs cont.

• *Oobius* larvae dissected from parasitized EAB eggs (arrows)









EAB Eggs: Parasitized or Not??

One of these 3 eggs from Great River Bluffs State Park, MN is <u>NOT</u> parasitized.

Which one?





Which Egg is NOT Parasitized?



- Close inspection shows that Egg A is hatched
- <u>Sometimes EAB</u>
 <u>frass becomes dark</u>

of Aariculture

Minnesota Department





EAB Eggs Suspect for Parasitism

Santa promises gifts, then delivers coal...more EAB eggs that are suspicious, but are NOT parasitized



D. Miller, USDA Forest Service





A. Hansen, Minn Dept. of Ag





EAB Eggs Suspect for Parasitism Revealed

These eggs are all hatched with dark frass...NOT parasitized! – frass marked with arrows



D. Miller, USDA Forest Service





A. Hansen, Minn Dept. of Ag





Unusual EAB Eggs



Unknown organism chewed through EAB egg



EAB egg fragment with fungi



EAB eggs with faded coloration

****None of these eggs are parasitized**



EAB Egg Look-alike: Scale Insect



Scale insect even also contain a tiny black parasitoid, meconium, and/or round adult parasitoid exit hole

- Scale can be easily confused for EAB eggs
- Similar size and color
- Distinguished by pointed end (scale mouthparts), wavy margin, segmented body





Scale vs. EAB Egg



A. Hansen, Minn Dept. of Ag



Minnesota Department ✓ of Agriculture Look for pointed end and other subtle differences to help distinguish

Fragments can be tricky



Scale vs. EAB Egg Revealed



A. Hansen, Minn Dept. of Ag



Minnesota Department

of Agriculture

Look for pointed end (yellow arrows) and other subtle differences to help distinguish scale from EAB eggs (black arrows)



Misc.

It is not unusual to find other eggs and arthropods in a debris sample.
 Collect what you find





Minnesota Department ⁄ of Agriculture





Wrapping Up

- Transfer collected eggs, fragments and arthropods into labeled vial or petri dish with friction fit lid
- Return sorted debris into container
- Store bark debris and petri dish in designated lab location





Where Are Parasitoids Being Released?



Fig. 1- Known distribution of emerald ash borer, *Agrilus planipennis , in North America as of February 2015 and the locations of EAB biocontrol agents.*. Map created by Applied Spatial Ecology and Technical Services, Department of Entomology, Michigan State University (East Lansing, Michigan, United States of America.

Minnesota Department of Agriculture

Bauer et al., 2015

Acknowledgements

- Leah Bauer, USDA Forest Service
- Deborah Miller, USDA Forest Service
- Parasitoids were produced and supplied by the USDA EAB Parasitoid Rearing Facility in Brighton, MI







The Most Livable City in America

References

- Abell, K.J., L.S. Bauer, J.J. Duan and R. van Driesche. 2014. Long term monitoring of the introduced emerald ash borer (Coleoptera: Buprestidae) egg parasitoid, *Oobius agrili* (Hymenoptera: Encyrtidae), in Michigan, USA and evaluation of newly developed monitoring technique. Biological Control, 79: 36-42. <u>Abell K.J. et al. 2014</u> (www.nrs.fs.fed.us/pubs/46867)
- Abell K.J., T.M. Poland, A.A. Cosse and L.S. Bauer. 2015. Trapping techniques for emerald ash borer and its introduced parasitoids. Ch. 7. In RG Van Driesche and R Reardon (eds). The Biology and Control of Emerald Ash Borer. FHTET 2014-09. USDA Forest Service, Morgantown, West Virginia, USA. Pp. 113-127. Abell et al. 2015 (www.nrs.fs.fed.us/pubs/49295)
- Bauer, L.S., J.J. Duan, J.R. Gould, and R. van Driesche. 2015. Progress in the classical biological control of Agrilus planipennis Fairmaire (Coleoptera: Buprestidae) in North America. Can. Entomol. 147: 300-314. <u>Bauer et al.</u> (www.nrs.fs.fed.us/pubs/48338)
- Duan, J.J., L.S. Bauer, J.A. Hansen, K.J. Abell and R. van Driesche. 2012. An improved method for monitoring parasitism and establishment of *Oobius agrili* (Hymenoptera: Encyrtidae), an egg parasitoid introduced for biological control of the emerald ash borer (Coleoptera: Buprestidae) in North America. Biological Control, 60: 255 -261. <u>Duan et al.</u> (www.nrs.fs.fed.us/pubs/40498)
- **Gould J.R., L.S. Bauer, J.J. Duan. 2015.** Emerald Ash Borer, *Agrilus planipennis* (Fairmaire), Biological Control Release and Recovery Guidelines. USDA APHIS-FS-ARS, Riverdale, Maryland. Online guide for land managers planning EAB biocontrol: <u>Gould et al. (www.nrs.fs.fed.us/pubs/48528)</u>
- USDA APHIS, 2007. The proposed release of three parasitoids for the biological control of the emerald ash borer (Agrilus planipennis) in the continental United States: environmental assessment. Federal Register 72, 28947–28948 (Docket No. APHIS-2007-0060). USDA APHIS (www.regulations.gov/fdmspublic/component/main?main=DocketDetail&d=APHIS-2007-0060)

